1	ROBBINS ARROYO LLP	
2	BRIAN J. ROBBINS (190264)   KEVIN A. SEELY (199982)	
3	ASHLEY R. RIFKIN (246602)	
4	STEVEN M. MCKANY (271405) 600 B Street, Suite 1900	
•	San Diego, CA 92101	
5	Telephone: (619) 525-3990 Facsimile: (619) 525-3991	
6	E-mail: brobbins@robbinsarroyo.com	
7	kseely@robbinsarroyo.com arifkin@robbinsarroyo.com	
8	smckany@robbinsarroyo.com	
9	LOCKRIDGE GRINDAL NAUEN P.L.L.P.	
	REBECCA A. PETERSON (241858) ROBERT K. SHELQUIST(pro hac vice)	
10	100 Washington Avenue South, Suite 2200	
11	Minneapolis, MN 55401 Telephone: (612) 339-6900	
12	Facsimile: (612) 339-0981	
13	E-mail: rapeterson@locklaw.com rkshelquist@locklaw.com	
14		
	Attorneys for Plaintiffs	
15	[Additional Counsel on Signature Page]	
16	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	
17	NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA	
18	SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION	
19	DANIEL ZEIGER and DANZ DOGGIE	) Case No. 3:17-cv-04056-WHO
20	DAYTRIPS, Individually and on Behalf of All Others Similarly Situated,	) <u>CLASS ACTION</u>
21	Plaintiffs,	) ) PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR
	v.	<ul><li>) VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL WITHOUT</li><li>) PREJUDICE AND WITHOUT NOTICE</li></ul>
22	WELLPET LLC, a Delaware corporation,	) AS TO PLAINTIFF DANZ DOGGIE
23	Defendant.	<ul><li>) DAYTRIPS; MEMORANDUM OF</li><li>) POINTS AND AUTHORITIES</li></ul>
24		) ) Judge: Hon. William H. Orrick
25		) Hearing Date: December 5, 2018
26		<ul><li>) Hearing Time: 2:00 p.m.</li><li>) Ctrm: 2, 17th Floor</li></ul>
27		
28		

PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL WITHOUT PREJUDICE AND WITHOUT NOTICE AS TO PLAINTIFF DANZ DOGGIE DAYTRIPS

1

### 2

3 4

5

67

8

9

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

2728

#### **NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION**

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE THAT on December 5, 2018, at 2:00 p.m., or as soon thereafter as the matter may be heard, in Courtroom 2, 17th Floor, of the U.S. District Court located at 450 Golden Gate Avenue, San Francisco, CA 94102, plaintiffs Daniel Zeiger ("Zeiger") and Danz Doggie Daytrips ("Danz") will and hereby do move the Court for an order voluntarily dismissing plaintiff Danz as a party from the above-captioned action, without prejudice and without notice, pursuant to Rules 23.1 and 41(a)(2) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. Plaintiff Zeiger will continue to be the named plaintiff in this action.

Rule 41 provides that "an action may be dismissed at the plaintiff's request only by court order, on terms that the court considers proper." Fed. R. Civ. P. 41(a)(2).

This motion is based on this Notice of Motion, the below Memorandum of Points and Authorities, the declaration of Steven M. McKany, the pleadings and documents on file in this case, and such other evidence as may be presented at or before the hearing on this motion.

Dated: October 24, 2018 Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Steven M. McKany

STEVEN M. McKany

ROBBINS ARROYO LLP BRIAN J. ROBBINS KEVIN A. SEELY ASHLEY R. RIFKIN STEVEN M. MCKANY 600 B Street, Suite 1900 San Diego, CA 92101 Telephone: (619) 525-3990 Facsimile: (619) 525-3991

E-mail: brobbins@robbinsarroyo.com kseely@robbinsarroyo.com arifkin@robbinsarroyo.com smckany@robbinsarroyo.com

LOCKRIDGE GRINDAL NAUEN P.L.L.P. ROBERT K. SHELQUIST REBECCA A. PETERSON 100 Washington Avenue South, Suite 2200 Minneapolis, MN 55401

Telephone: (612) 339-6900 Facsimile: (612) 339-0981 E-mail: rkshelquist@locklaw.com

rapeterson@locklaw.com

1 - 17-cv-04056-WHO

## GUSTAFSON GLUEK, PLLC DANIEL E. GUSTAFSON (Pro Hac Vice) KARLA M. GLUEK (*Pro Hac Vice*) DANIEL J. NORDIN (*Pro Hac Vice*) Canadian Pacific Plaza 120 South 6<sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 2600 Minneapolis, MN 55402 Telephone: (612) 333-8844 Facsimile: (612) 339-6622 E-mail: dgustafson@gustafsongluek.com kgluek@gustafsongluek.com dnordin@gustafsongluek.com Attorneys for Plaintiffs - 2 -17-cv-04056-WHO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL WITHOUT PREJUDICE AND

WITHOUT NOTICE AS TO PLAINTIFF DANZ DOGGIE DAYTRIPS

Case 3:17-cv-04056-WHO Document 100 Filed 10/25/18 Page 3 of 9

# 

#### 

# 

# 

#### 

# 

### 

# 

#### MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES

#### ISSUE TO BE DECIDED

Plaintiffs Daniel Zeiger ("Zeiger") and Danz Doggie Daytrips ("Danz" and together "Plaintiffs") hereby move the Court for an order voluntarily dismissing plaintiff Danz as a party from the above-captioned action, without prejudice pursuant to Rule 41(a)(2) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure ("Rule 41"). Plaintiff Zeiger will continue as a named plaintiff in this action.

#### STATEMENT OF RELEVANT FACTS

This action concerns certain of Defendant's dry dog food sold under the Wellness brand name that it packages, labels, markets, and advertises with representations that are intended to, and do, convey to consumers that the products possess certain qualities and characteristics that justify a premium price. ¶¶1-2, 36-45.¹ As detailed in the SAC, Defendant knew or should have known that the alleged premium products were not as represented because they contain undisclosed lead, arsenic, mercury, and bisphenol A, the presence of which are material to a reasonable consumer when making purchasing decisions. ¶¶2-21, 31-46, 52. As a consequence of Defendant's false and misleading marketing and omissions, it was able to capitalize on, and reap profits from, consumers who paid a premium for products that were not sold as advertised. ¶¶21, 28, 78.

At this stage in the litigation, the parties are engaged in the exchange of discovery in preparation for class certification. Declaration of Steven M. McKany in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Voluntary Dismissal without Prejudice and Without Notice as to Plaintiff Danz Doggie Daystrips ("McKany Decl."), at 2. Zeiger and his company, Danz, are each named plaintiffs in this action. *Id.*, ¶3. Plaintiff Zeiger is an individual, and plaintiff Danz is his dog daycare company. *Id.* Plaintiffs' claims are based on putative class members' direct purchases of Defendant's products. *Id.*, ¶4; *see also* ¶¶57-58. However, during the discovery process,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Unless otherwise noted, all references to "¶\_\_" or "¶¶\_\_" are to Plaintiffs' Second Amended Class Action Complaint ("SAC"), filed on July 2, 2018 (ECF No. 95).

1 Defendant sought documents and information from plaintiff Danz that Plaintiffs strongly believe 2 are inappropriate and threatened to needlessly harm or harass plaintiff Danz, such as seeking identification of plaintiff Danz's clients, which Plaintiffs believe are irrelevant to the claims at 3 4 issue. McKany Decl., ¶5. Plaintiffs believe that the easiest way to resolve this discovery dispute 5 is to voluntarily dismiss plaintiff Danz; Plaintiff Zeiger will continue as named plaintiff without any prejudice to the class. Id., ¶6. Thus, on August 1, 2018, Plaintiffs' counsel reached out to 6 7 Defendant's counsel to request that the parties stipulate to the voluntary dismissal of plaintiff 8 Danz. Id., ¶7. However, nearly three months later, on October 24, 2018, after Plaintiffs' counsel 9 sent numerous (often ignored) follow-up e-mails, defense counsel informed Plaintiffs' counsel 10 for the first time that they would not agree to the voluntarily dismiss plaintiff Danz, and would

ARGUMENT

brought the instant motion. McKany Decl., ¶24.

instead be proceeding with scheduling its deposition. *Id.*, ¶¶7-23. Hence, Plaintiffs have now

13 14

15

16

11

12

Rule 41 provides that, after service of an answer and where stipulation cannot be obtained, "an action may be dismissed at the plaintiff's request only by court order, on terms that the court considers proper." Fed. R. Civ. P. 41(a)(2). Dismissal rests in the court's sound discretion. *Hamilton v. Firestone Tire & Rubber Co., Inc.*, 679 F.2d 143, 145 (9th Cir. 1982).

17 18

19

20

21

Dismissal of plaintiff Danz will not prejudice Defendant. This action concerns Plaintiffs and the putative class purchasing the products at issue based on Defendant's false and/or deceptive labeling, packaging, marketing, and advertising. Plaintiffs' claims are based on putative class members' direct purchases of Defendant's products. The dismissal of plaintiff Zieger's company, plaintiff Danz, is inconsequential, and Defendant can still seek information, and has, regarding plaintiff Zeiger's purchases of Defendant's products.

2324

25

26

Dismissal of plaintiff Danz also will not prejudice the interests of other class members and the requirements of Rule 23(e) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure do not apply because (i) no class has been certified; (ii) this dismissal is without prejudice; and (iii) plaintiff Zeiger continues to serve as a putative class representative and named plaintiff and will continue the

27

28

1	duty toward absent class members. See McKany Decl., ¶¶2-3. Additionally, there has been no	
2	settlement or compromise and neither plaintiff Danz nor its counsel has received nor will receive	
3	any consideration from Defendant for the dismissal. See McKany Decl., ¶26.	
4	CONCLUSION	
5	For the foregoing reasons, Plaintiffs' motion to voluntarily dismiss plaintiff Danz should	
6	be granted.	
7	Dated: October 25, 2018 ROBBINS ARROYO LLP	
8	BRIAN J. ROBBINS KEVIN A. SEELY	
9	ASHLEY R. RIFKIN STEVEN M. MCKANY	
10	/s/ Steven M. McKany	
11	STEVEN M. McKany 600 B Street, Suite 1900	
12	San Diego, CA 92101 Telephone: (619) 525-3990	
12	Facsimile: (619) 525-3991	
13	E-mail: brobbins@robbinsarroyo.com	
14	kseely@robbinsarroyo.com arifkin@robbinsarroyo.com	
15	smckany@robbinsarroyo.com	
16	LOCKRIDGE GRINDAL NAUEN P.L.L.P. ROBERT K. SHELQUIST	
17	REBECCA A. PETERSON 100 Washington Avenue South, Suite 2200	
18	Minneapolis, MN 55401 Telephone: (612) 339-6900	
19	Facsimile: (612) 339-0981 E-mail: rkshelquist@locklaw.com	
20	rapeterson@locklaw.com	
21	GUSTAFSON GLUEK, PLLC DANIEL E. GUSTAFSON ( <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> )	
22	KARLA M. GLUEK ( <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> ) DANIEL J. NORDIN ( <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> )	
23	Canadian Pacific Plaza 120 South 6 <sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 2600	
24	Minneapolis, MN 55402 Telephone: (612) 333-8844	
25	Facsimile: (612) 339-6622 E-mail: dgustafson@gustafsongluek.com	
26	kgluek@gustafsongluek.com dnordin@gustafsongluek.com	
27	Attorneys for Plaintiffs	
28	1284360	
20	- 5 - 17-cv-04056-WHO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL WITHOUT PREJUDICE AND	

PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL WITHOUT PREJUDICE AND WITHOUT NOTICE AS TO PLAINTIFF DANZ DOGGIE DAYTRIPS

# **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE** I hereby certify that on October 25, 2018, I authorized the electronic filing of the foregoing PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL WITHOUT PREJUDICE AND WITHOUT NOTICE AS TO PLAINTIFF DANZ DOGGIE DAYTRIPS; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES, and all attachments thereto, with the Clerk of Court of the United States District Court, Northern District of California by using the CM/ECF system, which will serve electronic notification of this filing to all counsel of record. /s/ Steven M. McKany Steven M. McKany

- 6 - 17-cv-04056-WHO
PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL WITHOUT PREJUDICE AND
WITHOUT NOTICE AS TO PLAINTIFF DANZ DOGGIE DAYTRIPS

# Mailing Information for a Case 3:17-cv-04056-WHO Zeiger et al v. WellPet LLC et al

#### **Electronic Mail Notice List**

The following are those who are currently on the list to receive e-mail notices for this case.

#### • Raina Challeen Borrelli

rborrelli@gustafsongluek.com

#### • Joan Alexis Rabutaso Camagong

jcamagong@shb.com,jabrooks@shb.com,cishihara@shb.com,rdarmstadt@shb.com,SFDistribution@shb.com

#### • Susana Cruz Hodge

scruzhodge@litedepalma.com,epalomino@litedepalma.com

#### • Joseph J. DePalma

jdepalma@litedepalma.com,epalomino@litedepalma.com

#### • Elizabeth Anne Fessler

efessler@shb.com

#### • Daniel E. Gustafson

dgustafson@gustafsongluek.com

#### • Charles J. LaDuca

charlesl@cuneolaw.com

#### • Paul B. LaScala

plascala@shb.com,hkeresztes@shb.com

#### Steven M. McKany

smckany@robbinsarroyo.com,notice@robbinsarroyo.com,jsilverwood@robbinsarroyo.com

#### • James P. Muehlberger

jmuehlberger@shb.com,lcaldwell@shb.com,SFdistribution@shb.com

#### • Amir M. Nassihi

anassihi@shb.com,jabrooks@shb.com,tkeys@shb.com,rdarmstadt@shb.com,SFDistribution@shb.com

#### • Rebecca Anne Peterson

rapeterson@locklaw.com,kjleroy@locklaw.com,bgilles@locklaw.com

#### • Ashley Rawlins Rifkin

arifkin@robbinsarroyo.com,rsalazar@robbinsarroyo.com,notice@robbinsarroyo.com

#### Brian J. Robbins

notice@robbinsarroyo.com

#### • William Roth Sampson, Mr

wsampson@shb.com,rdarmstadt@shb.com,jmoreno@shb.com

#### • Kevin Andrew Seelv

kseely@robbinsarroyo.com,notice@robbinsarroyo.com

#### Case 3:17-cv-04056-WHO Document 100 Filed 10/25/18 Page 9 of 9

- Robert K. Shelquist rkshelquist@locklaw.com,aanewfield@locklaw.com,kjleroy@locklaw.com,brgilles@locklaw.com
- Catherine Sung-Yun K. Smith csmith@gustafsongluek.com
- Katherine Van Dyck kvandyck@cuneolaw.com

#### **Manual Notice List**

The following is the list of attorneys who are **not** on the list to receive e-mail notices for this case (who therefore require manual noticing). You may wish to use your mouse to select and copy this list into your word processing program in order to create notices or labels for these recipients.

Daniel Jay Nordin Gustafson Gluek PLLC 120 S. 6th St., Ste. 2600 Minneapolis, MN 55402